TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF BIDDERS

for

CONSTRUCTION OF DADHOCHA DAM

1. M/s Hafiz Rab Nawaz & Company
2. M/s Maqbool – Calson (Joint Venture)
3. M/s FAATIR – LAC (Joint Venture)
4. M/s Khyber Grace (Pvt.) Limited
5. M/s Ramzan & Sons (Pvt.) Limited
6. M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO)

May 2020
CONSTRUCTION OF DADHOCHA DAM

TECHNICAL EVALUATION OF BIDDERS

The "Single Stage, Two Envelop" bids by the Contractor firms was invited through widely notified invitation by the DGPR. Last date for submission of bids was fixed as April 23, 2020. In response to the above, fifteen (15) Contracting firms purchased bidding documents, however following six (06) bidders submitted their Technical and Financial bids on the scheduled date and time of submission.

1. M/s Hafiz Rab Nawaz & Company
2. M/s Maqbool - Calson (Joint Venture)
3. M/s FAATIR - LAC (Joint Venture)
4. M/s Khyber Grace (Pvt.) Limited
5. M/s Ramzan & Sons (Pvt.) Limited
6. M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO)

After receiving above mentioned offers by the contracting firms by Central Procurement Committee (CPC), the Technical bids were handed over to the sub-committee constituted by the Additional Secretary (Technical) Irrigation Department. During initial scrutiny of the technical bids submitted, sub-committee revealed necessity of certain clarifications by the bidders without any change in substance of the bids, Under the clause-33 of PPRA Rules 2014 as well as Clause-26 of General Directions for the Guidance of the Tenderer.

Accordingly, Executive Engineer, Small Dams Division, Islamabad sent letters to all six participating bidders individually for necessary clarifications essentially required for evaluation as per declared criteria in bidding documents. The last date for submission of clarification was fixed by the XEN concerned as May 04, 2020 vide his following individual letters to the bidders;


Upon receipt of response / clarifications from the all bidders, technical evaluation was revisited by the sub-committee and observations/findings were discussed in Centeral Procurement Committee meeting dated May 06, 2020.
The submitted clarification by M/s FAATIR – LAC (Joint Venture) was again found deficient, therefore it was decided in above mentioned CPC meeting to request the bidder to furnish certain original documents along with certified Income Tax returns for necessary verifications. The bidder was desired to furnish requisite documents vide XEN’s office letter No. EE/SDD/2020/1202-03/6-A dated 06-05-2020. It was responded by the bidder and subsequently evaluated.

The sub-committee, based on the available documents/data, the technical bids along with the clarifications furnished by the respective bidders, have evaluated as per criteria provided in bidding documents (attached as Annexure-A). The summary attached unfolds the evaluated points scored by each bidder as under:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. #</th>
<th>Bidder Name</th>
<th>Total Score</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>M/s Hafiz Rab Nawaz &amp; Company</td>
<td>88.41</td>
<td>Qualified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>M/s Maqbool - Calson (Joint Venture)</td>
<td>54.75</td>
<td>Dis-Qualified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>M/s FAATIR - LAC (Joint Venture)</td>
<td>49.50</td>
<td>Dis-Qualified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>M/s Khyber Grace (Pvt) Limited</td>
<td>66.76</td>
<td>Dis-Qualified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>M/s Ramzan &amp; Sons (Pvt.) Limited</td>
<td>84.13</td>
<td>Qualified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>M/s Frontier Works Organization</td>
<td>83.00</td>
<td>Qualified</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The detailed summary and corresponding evaluation of each bidder is provided in subsequent pages:

Deputy Director
Planning & Procurement
SPRU, Irrigation Deptt.
Lahore (Convener)

Deputy Director (M&E)
SPRU, Irrigation Department,
Lahore (Member)

Executive Engineer
Small Dams Division
Islamabad (Member)

Project Manager
ADP Consultants
Nespak, Lahore (Member)
Subject: CONSTRUCTION OF DADHOCHA DAM

A meeting of Central Procurement Committee under the convenership of Additional Secretary (Technical) was held on 08-05-2020 at 15:30 pm in the committee room of Irrigation Department, to discuss evaluation of technical bids for the project "Construction of Dadhocha Dam". The Executive Engineer, Small Dams Division, Islamabad informed the central procurement committee that the sub-Committee comprising Executive Engineer, Small Dams Division, Islamabad, Deputy Director (Planning & Procurement) SPRU, Deputy Director (M&E) SPRU and Project Manager ADP Consultants, NESPAK have evaluated the technical bid of subject project and have submitted the evaluation report with results as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Name of Firm</th>
<th>Status of Firm</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>M/s Hafiz Rab Nawaz &amp; Company</td>
<td>Qualified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>M/s Maqbool – Calson (Joint Venture)</td>
<td>Disqualified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>M/s FAATIR – LAC (Joint Venture)</td>
<td>Disqualified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>M/s Khyber Grace (Pvt.) Limited</td>
<td>Disqualified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>M/s Ramzan &amp; Sons (Pvt.) Limited</td>
<td>Qualified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO)</td>
<td>Qualified</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Central Procurement Committee after detailed deliberations agreed with the evaluation of sub-Committee and gave direction to Executive Engineer, Small Dams Division, Islamabad to inform all bidders to participate in the meeting of CPC to be held on 11-05-2020 at 14:00 hours in the committee room of Irrigation Department, Old Anarkali, Lahore for the announcement of results of the "Technical Evaluation" and to open the "Financial Bids" of qualified bidders.

Additional Secretary (Technical)  
Irrigation Department  
Lahore (Convener)

Chief Engineer  
Irrigation Development Zone  
Lahore (Member)

Executive Engineer  
Small Dams Division  
Islamabad (Member)

Chief Monitoring  
PMIU, Irrigation Department  
Lahore (Member)

Deputy Director (Planning & Procurement)  
SPRU, Irrigation Department  
Lahore (Member)

Project Manager  
ADP Consultants, NESPAK  
Lahore (Member)
FINANCIAL EVALUATION OF BIDDERS

for

CONSTRUCTION OF DADHOCHA DAM

1. M/s Hafiz Rab Nawaz & Company
2. M/s Ramzan & Sons (Pvt.) Limited
3. M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO)

May 2020
PUNJAB IRRIGATION DEPARTMENT

Subject: CONSTRUCTION OF DADHOCHA DAM

TENDER EVALUATION REPORT

Kindly refer to the minutes of meeting held on 15-05-2020 regarding opening of financial bids of above cited work in which the Sub-Committee of Central Procurement Committee was directed to prepare and submit the evaluation report.

The salient features of the aforesaid scheme are as follows:

Total cost of T.S Estimate: = Rs. 6,365.259 Million
Total cost without contingency and PRA: = Rs. 3,274.638 Million

15 No. bidders purchased the tenders and six (06) bidders submitted their technical and financial bids. Out of six bidders three bidders were evaluated technically qualified. Bids of all the three technically qualified bidders were opened. One bidder quoted the rates in figures while the other two bidders quoted the rates in figures as well as in words.

During the scrutiny of opened financial bids, it has been observed that rates quoted in words & figures by M/s Hafiz Rab Nawaz & Company for the following items, necessitated some clarifications:

1. Item No. 32: (Rate quoted in words was not clear & not corresponding with rate in figure)
2. Item No. 77: (Rate quoted in words was not clear & not corresponding with rate in figure)
3. Item No. 119 (Rate quoted in words was not clear & not corresponding with rate in figure)

Accordingly, under PPRA Rule-33 and Clause-26 of General Directions for the Guidance of Tenderers, clarification was sought from M/s Hafiz Rabnawaz & Company, vide Executive Engineer Small Dams Division Islamabad letter No. EE/SDD/2020/1455-56/6-A dated 18-05-2020 (copy attached). Further, clarification regarding the note written in the end of Bid Schedule was also sought.

In response M/s Hafiz Rabnawaz & Company has furnish clarification vide his office letter No. 96HRC dated 19-05-2020 (copy attached) which were accepted by the evaluation sub-committee and incorporated the clarified rates in the evaluation report. It may be noted that subject corrections have neither affected substance of bid nor status / rank of the bidder.
Comparative Statement of the Contractor's bids has been prepared after working out the total bid amount offered by each bidder applying arithmetic check on all item rates quoted in the respective bids. The resultant Comparative Statement along with percentage above / below T.S estimate is as under:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sr. No.</th>
<th>Contractor</th>
<th>Evaluated Bid Amount Rs.</th>
<th>Percentage Above/Below</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>M/s Hafiz Rabnawaz &amp; Company</td>
<td>2,581,036,121</td>
<td>21.18% below</td>
<td>Quoted rates in figures &amp; words</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>M/s Ramzan &amp; Sons (Pvt.) Limited</td>
<td>2,947,268,794</td>
<td>10.00% below</td>
<td>Quoted rates in figures &amp; words</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>M/s Frontier Works Organization (FWO)</td>
<td>2,650,843,230</td>
<td>19.05% below</td>
<td>Quoted rates in figures</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As per evaluation, M/s Hafiz Rabnawaz & Company has quoted the lowest bid amounting to Rs. 2,581,036,121/- (two billion five hundred eighty one million thirty six thousand one hundred and twenty one rupees only).

Submitted to Central Procurement Committee, Irrigation Department for further necessary action in this regard.

Executive Engineer  
Small Dams Division  
Islamabad (Member)  

Project Manager  
ABP Consultants, NESPAK  
(Member)  

Deputy Director (Planning & Procurement)  
SPRU, Irrigation Department  
(Convener)  

Deputy Director (M&E)  
SPRU, Irrigation Department  
(Member)  

D.A Comparative Statement
Subject: CONSTRUCTION OF DADHOCHA DAM

During the meeting held on 15-05-2020 regarding opening of financial bids of above cited work, three (03) tenders were handed over to Sub-Committee comprising Deputy Director Planning & Procurement SPRU, Deputy Director (M&E) SPRU, Project Manager ADP Consultants NESPAK, and Executive Engineer, Small Dams Division, Islamabad to evaluate bids offered by the bidders (Minutes attached as Annexure-A). Sub-Committee recommended M/s Hafiz Rabnawaz & Company as the lowest bidder (Report attached as Annexure-B).

Hence, during meeting of CPC held on 21-05-2020, the lowest bidder, M/s Hafiz Rabnawaz & Company is recommended for award of contract amounting to Rs.2,581,036,121/- (two billion five hundred eighty one million thirty six thousand one hundred & twenty one rupees only) subject to the submission of Performance Security under clause 7 of the contract agreement as well as Additional Performance Security in compliance to the Clause 26 (A) of “General Direction for Guidance of the Tenderer”. The recommendation is further subject to the condition that Call Deposit Receipt submitted by the lowest bidder may be got verified by the Executive Engineer, Small Dams Division, Islamabad from the respective Bank at personal level.

The Executive Engineer, Small Dams Division, Islamabad is hereby directed to proceed further as per rules for approval of the rates quoted by the lowest bidder by observing all legal, codal and procedural formalities. However, the award of the contract is subject to the final decision of the Honorable Lahore High Court in the Writ Petition No. 18974 of 2020 titled “M/s Muhammad Asad & Co. Vs Government of Punjab etc.”

Additional Secretary (Technical)
Irrigation Department
Lahore (Convener)

Executive Engineer,
Small Dams Division
Islamabad (Member)

Deputy Director (Planning & Procurement)
SPRU, Irrigation Department
Lahore (Member)

Chief Engineer
Irrigation Development Zone
Lahore (Member)

Chief Monitoring
PMIU, Irrigation Department
Lahore (Member)

Project Manager
ADP Consultants, NESPAK
Lahore (Member)